

**PEF LABOR/MANAGEMENT QUARTERLY MEETING**  
**DECEMBER 4TH, 2024**

MINUTES

**THE MEETING COMMENCED AT 10:05AM.**

**I. ATTENDEES:**

*Management Attendees:* Comptroller DiNapoli; First Deputy Comptroller Pete Grannis; Chief of Staff Shawn Thompson; Executive Deputy Comptroller Andrea Miller; Chief Information Officer Colin Brady; Associate Counsel Peter Sinclair; Supervising Attorney Jenika Conboy; Inspector General Donnal Hinds; Deputy Comptroller Jason Windsor; Assistant Deputy Comptroller Jeremy Disare; Deputy Comptroller Robin Lois; Executive Deputy Comptroller Colleen Gardner; Director Kara Langdon; Deputy Comptroller Karim Adeen-Hasan; Assistant Comptroller Julie Miller; Deputy Comptroller Rae Ellen Burke; Deputy Comptroller Andrea Goldberger; Executive Deputy Comptroller Terri Crowley; Director Aja Griffiths; Director Adam Acquario; Deputy Comptroller Nancy Hernandez; Director Kara Langdon; Director Nancy Koller; Director Randy Hotaling; Director Beverly Jones; Director Courtney Bernard; Labor Relations Representative Michelle Gallo; Labor Relations Representative Rachael Clevenger; Human Resources Specialist 2 Sara Burt; Labor Relations Representative Gillian Gersen; Administrative Assistant Erin Bailey; Administrative Assistant Leah Boggs; Administrative Assistant Amanda Allen.

*PEF Attendees:* Council Leader and L/M Chair Catherine Dell'Angelo; Assistant Council Leader Andre Brown; PEF VP Headquarters Bruce Giddings; Secretary Priscilla Amrock; Assistant Council Leader (288) Brenda-Lee Persad; Field Representative Ed Bradley; Region 8 Coordinator Danielle Bridger; Regional Local Chair Matthew Colangelo; Executive Board Member Dan Winkler; Executive Board Member Shari Hunziker; Steward Troy Decker; Steward Kimberly Goerlich; Treasurer Kelly Nadeau; SGA Local LM Chair Robert Horn; LM Assistant Chelsea Propati; Alternate Sylvia Mlynarska; Steward James Rappaport; Steward Maeve Wood; Steward Alyssa Noel

**II. OPENING REMARKS HIGHLIGHTS:**

**COMPTROLLER DINAPOLI:**

The Comptroller opened his remarks by welcoming everyone to the last meeting of the year; he hoped everyone had a good Thanksgiving with family and friends.

The 2024 OSC Holiday Gathering will take place on December 18, 2024, from 1:00 PM to 4:00 PM on the third floor at 110 State Street. A special thanks to our PEF & CSEA partners for their continued generosity and support of this program.

Donations of hats, gloves, and scarves will be collected in the lobby of 110 State Street until December 18. All donations will be given to the Marillac Family Shelter at St. Catherine's Center for Children in Albany.

The annual Toys for Tots Campaign will be collecting unwrapped new toys until December 9th. Thank you to everyone who is contributing to this important cause during the holiday season.

The New Employee Welcome Service will be re-launched in January 2025. HR will host four sessions annually, scheduled for January, April, July, and November. Sessions will be offered in person and virtually.

The cafeteria on the 2nd floor of 110 State Street will soon be reopening. The cafeteria will be under new management and will be called "The 110 Café by Epicurean Feast."

Employee Development Week, led by Human Resources, with assistance from an agency-wide team and our union partners, was a success again this year. There were 63 training classes held; 13 were new classes. A total of 166 employees viewed LinkedIn learning content during EDW. There were 943 OSC employees who attended EDW and 743 were in PEF positions. 2,360 total seats were filled. Participation increased by 101 employees this year.

Local sales tax collections in New York state increased by 2.3% in October compared to the same month in 2023. Overall, local collections totaled \$1.84 billion for the month, up \$41 million year over year. New York City saw a 4.1% increase in collections, amounting to \$33 million. In total, county collections grew by 0.4%, with 36 out of 57 counties outside of New York City reporting an increase.

State tax receipts totaled \$54.6 billion through the first six months of State Fiscal Year 2024-25, \$682.1 million higher than the state Division of the Budget estimates in the First Quarterly Update to the 2024-25 Enacted Budget Financial Plan. On a year-over-year basis, tax collections were \$3.1 billion higher than those through September 2023, primarily driven by the Personal Income Tax.

The State's General Fund ended September with a balance of \$52.4 billion, \$3.2 billion higher than DOB projected and \$4.4 billion higher than last year at the same time primarily due to higher than anticipated tax collections and lower than anticipated spending.

The estimated value of the New York State Common Retirement Fund was \$274.6 billion at the end of the second quarter of state fiscal year 2024-25. For the three-month period ending Sept. 30, 2024, Fund investments returned an estimated 4.15%. As of September 30, 2024, the Fund had 42.01% of its assets invested in publicly traded equities. The remaining Fund assets by allocation are invested in cash, bonds, and mortgages (22.22%), private equity (14.45%), real estate and real assets (13.32%), and credit, absolute return strategies, and opportunistic alternatives (8%). The Fund's long-term expected rate of return is 5.9%.

For the State Fiscal Year 2025-26, the employer contribution rates for the New York State and Local Retirement System will increase. The contribution rate for the Employees' Retirement System will go up from 15.2% to 16.5%, while the rate for the Police and Fire Retirement System will rise from 31.2% to 33.7%. Several factors influenced these rate increases, including inflation, higher salaries, recent legislative changes (notably reforms to Tier 6), and the rates at which members are retiring. As of March 31, 2024, NYSLRS had a funded ratio of 93.2%, and it is consistently ranked among the

best-funded retirement systems in the nation. A high funding ratio indicates that NYSLRS has sufficient funds to provide retirement benefits to its over 1.2 million members, which include more than 710,000 current and former state and local government employees, as well as over 520,000 retirees and their beneficiaries.

The Comptroller closed his remarks by wishing everyone a safe and happy holiday! The Comptroller thanked Catherine for her leadership and indicated that he is grateful to have a constructive relationship with PEF.

### **SUMMARY OF PEF REMARKS.**

#### **CATHERINE DELL'ANGELO, COUNCIL LEADER, L/M/ CO-CHAIR:**

Catherine began by welcoming Sonia Moulahoum and Brenda Lee Persad as new officers with Local 288. She also introduced Bruce Giddings, who is the new VP at headquarters and the statewide labor management chair. Catherine mentioned the bill that passed both houses stating that if an employee in the process of applying for retirement passes away before their retirement date, the payout will still be made.

PEF is grateful for the updates they asked for last quarter and thanked Jenika for her presentation about numbers of discrimination and sexual harassment cases. Catherine also thanked HR and Beverly, specifically for providing the data she requested on behalf of PEF.

Catherine talked about the bills that PEF headquarters have been pushing through to the Governor which include bullying and abusive language, regulation and disclosure of AI by State agencies, and expanding workers compensation to include stress, anxiety, depression and emotional disorders. PEF is hopeful for more enhancements to tier 6 in the upcoming year.

The regional PEF holiday party will be held in Latham at Century House on December 21<sup>st</sup> at 6 p.m.

#### **JULIE MILLER, ASSISTANT COMPTROLLER OF HUMAN RESOURCES:**

Julie Miller opened her remarks by expressing how grateful she is for our PEF partners and their continued support of HR's programs. Management meets weekly with PEF & CSEA to communicate issues and ideas.

The holiday ecard contest is going on; a winner will be selected soon, and the winning ecard will be available for everyone's use. Over 200 Ecards have been sent since January 2024.

The Aspiring Leaders program for grades 18-22 was held in the fall and HR advertised four public service workshops.

Representatives Aja Griffiths and Sara Burt from the Stay Interview committee will give an update at today's meeting. Catherine was concerned about the turnover in the committee co-leads and Julie confirmed that Resa left for another job and Lynn was happy to stay on the committee, but when Aja

came to work in HR, this committee was best aligned with her position and Aja plans to remain on this committee along with Sara Burt.

### **III. STANDING ITEMS:**

#### **Written Updates**

Regarding written updates, PEF had the following questions.

Catherine asked why the Manager of Information Technical Services (TC) was reclassified with the parenthetical removed? What does TC stand for? Courtney Bernard said that TC stood for telecommunications and Colin Brady mentioned that telecommunications was very specific; by removing (TC), it opens more opportunities.

Catherine asked if the Administrative Specialist 2, grade 23 is a new position. The position is new to Legal but has been used in the agency. Catherine asked what an earmarked item was. Courtney answered that Civil Service will put an earmark on a position that was not being filled appropriately. Dan Winkler asked if there were other titles that were earmarked. Randy said that this was not the only title earmarked. Ed Bradley questioned if earmarking was only relevant to positions that are vacant, and Randy said yes. Randy went on to explain that there are other earmarks that exist besides Civil Service, Class and Comp (DOB, agency, and Civil Service Commission) and PEF asked for a list of earmarked items to be provided to them.

There are 15 positions pending in Local Government and School Accountability. Are these intended to be a new unit? Courtney replied that they are replacing titles in an existing unit with new titles. Ed Bradley asked if those positions are replacing titles currently being utilized. Courtney responded to Ed that the positions will be posted, and current employees have the choice of applying for and moving into the new title or staying in their current position. If employees are looking for advancement, they should apply and move into the new title. Dan Winkler asked if it was up to a grade 25 and requested that the classification request be sent to PEF. Dan indicated that PEF received past classification requests. Courtney confirmed these titles are PEF positions up to grade 29.

Catherine asked if OSC had CIO Computer Operator grade 10 positions. Courtney said yes and they are CSEA positions.

Under workspace updates a new call center for downstate is listed. What is considered downstate? Jason Windsor explained that they are looking at the lower Hudson Valley area, Westchester, Bronx and Yonkers because of the market, parking, good access and population for hiring new employees. Colleen Gardner mentioned that Buffalo was also being considered for the retirement call center. Previous call centers in the Buffalo area have closed so those buildings would be up to code and specifications. The Comptroller said another call center is needed and areas outside of Albany were being considered but a specific location has not been identified.

Catherine asked about ERS scanning moving to 800 North Pearl Street. Jason mentioned that the timeline for the move would be a year out due to a full buildout and furniture plan. The current lease at Riverview remains in holdover. A new space at Riverview is being requested for ERS staff.

Dan Winkler questioned Management Services working on a new lease for LGSA in Newburgh. Jason indicated that the current lease is good through December 2026. Other options are being looked at in the same vicinity on either side of the river. He also stated that the current building could be leased again.

Andre Brown asked what type of outdated furniture was being updated. Jason stated that regional offices with old furniture would be updated such as regional offices (LGSA) and furniture in OUF in NYC.

Catherine asked where video doorbells were being installed. Jason stated everywhere they can. Currently, some employees are opening the door at certain sites without a window or knowing who is behind it.

Catherine asked about first responder training with AED/CPR and Narcan. Jason stated that every location has a first aid, Narcan, and AED kits.

#### **IV. PEF Agenda Items:**

##### 2025 Dates for LM Meetings

PEF is requesting dates be scheduled for LM meetings in 2025. This is in progress.

##### Alternate Work Schedule

Catherine stated that there are a few divisions that have been moving away from allowing alternative work schedules. Employees were instructed during interviews with new employees to not offer an alternative schedule. The question was asked if there is a push towards upper management to move away from this option. Shawn Thompson answered no. Catherine mentioned that alternate work schedules are set up for balancing life, medical, etc. and some divisions will not allow a start time before 8 am. Colleen Gardner mentioned that retirement was not moving away from this option but looking at it based on operational need in the bureaus. A discussion took place regarding whether the option to begin work before 8 a.m. was due to coverage or getting work done. Colleen will investigate this issue. Catherine will put this on the Local LM agenda to discuss further. Colin Brady indicated that the CIO often utilizes alternate work schedules and Terri Crowley said that Operations has not changed their stance on alternate work schedules and still allow them in many areas of the division.

##### SGA Exam Updates

Courtney stated that Civil Service was planning to modernize their exams and OSC requested SPE 2 exam in March and will request SPE 3 & 4.

#### **V. SUMMARY OF MANAGEMENT'S AGENDA:**

##### Stay Interview

Committee members Aja Griffiths and Sara Burt gave an update on the stay interview project. They stated that a subcommittee was formed to move the project along faster. The process will be a two-part approach with a 14-question survey and a follow-up seven question interview. The committee met with

both unions in September, and both agreed with the survey and interview questions proposed. An infographic of the process was displayed showing the process for rollout. Phase 1 includes training prior to conducting surveys and building the survey. Phase 2 consists of testing the survey, rolling out the survey and rolling out the interviews. In phase 3, data from the surveys and interviews will be analyzed and a visual presentation of the findings will be created. In the final phase, developing plans for implementing change within the agency will occur.

Aja stated that this is a large project and to make sure it is rolled out with integrity, the committee is looking to use a vendor that has expertise in subject matter along with training and development to guide them in the process. Catherine stated that she thought this project was being done in-house so that a vendor was not needed. Aja stated that the vendor was for guidance and to ensure a smooth rollout.

### *Safety in Downtown Albany*

Jason Windsor states there is not a lot to report. There has been very little activity or complaints. A meeting with OGS, County officials, Albany PD, and State Police will be held next week. OSC expects that increased activity will be at the Empire State Plaza due to the winter weather.

### *Building/Space*

A timeframe is not yet set for the scanning group to move to 800 No. Pearl Street. Jason stated that on November 4, an emergency communication drill was conducted and was successful with over a 95% participation rate. Catherine personally thanked Beverly, Julie, Jason and Leah for keeping her in the loop when issues occur in the building and appreciates Beverly texting her on her days off.

Jason explained that in the next couple of weeks, 59 Maden Lane will receive security turnstiles similar to those at the 110 State Street building. Additionally, Management Services is developing a visitor management electronic system like the one in use at 110 State Street. The 23rd floor is also scheduled to undergo renovations, including a new carpet and paint, which will take approximately 3 to 4 months to complete.

### *Cafeteria*

Jason announced that the 110 Café is targeting early January for opening. The company, along with OSC Management Services has been deep cleaning, replacing equipment that was outdated, installing TV screens for electronic menus, and installing point of sale self-checkout kiosks to be used after hours or during the day. Online ordering will be available along with catering for the building. Jason stated that the company has been doing a lot of interviewing and marketing is the next step in the process. Comptroller DiNapoli raised the question of Jimmy, who previously worked in the cafeteria coming back to work in the new café. Jason said that Jimmy received an application but is unsure if he will return to OSC.

Catherine asked about the first-floor store returning. Jason stated that they were going to incorporate many of the items on the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor. Having the store open in the lobby would mean having it be available to the public and OSC is not looking to do that currently.

## VI. Review ACTION ITEMS:

Julie updated the group on action items from the last meeting. The following items have been completed:

- Provide high level report of any complaints filed with DDM.
- Include data on trainee levels from 5/9/24 through 8/14/24 for NY helps.
- Provide detailed data on resignations from 5/9/24 through 8/14/24.
- Provide status of filed grievances.
- Attend Assistant Comptroller meeting and Deputy Comptroller meeting to discuss the role of supervisors in RA process. Beverly spoke at an Assistant Comptroller meeting. (Karim will inform the Deputy Comptrollers).
- Post OSC Insider with link to the FAQs about the RA process.
- Provide walking program data on numbers of PEF employees who applied for the walking program by division.

The following action items are ongoing:

- Provide quarterly feedback from exit surveys to PEF.
- Written updates going forward will be broken down by division.
- Include NY HELPS data on written updates going forward.

### Action Items From This Meeting

- Randy will provide an earmark report to PEF.
- Courtney will provide duties for LGSA classification.
- 2025 Dates for LM meetings and PEF will be scheduled.
- Beverly will discuss the role of the supervisor in the RA process at an upcoming personnel liaison meeting.
- Karim will discuss the role of the supervisor in the RA process at an upcoming Deputy Comptroller meeting.

## VII. CLOSING REMARKS:

Julie Miller concluded the meeting by wishing everyone happy holidays.

THE MEETING WAS ADJOURNED AT **11:37AM**

Catherine A. Dell'Angelo  
**Catherine Dell'Angelo**  
**Council Leader/LM Chair**

03/07/2025  
**Date**

Julie Miller  
**Julie Miller,**  
**Management Co-Chair**

12/16/2024  
**Date**